

RASD Coalition's Third Report on Monitoring the National Dialogue Conference

For the Period of May 7 -July 8, 2013



Executive Summary

The RASD Coalition has followed the National Dialogue Conference (NDC) since its launch, and monitored its proceedings and sessions. Today, the Coalition issues its third report, covering the period from May 7 to July 8, on which day the Second Plenary Session was concluded.

This report primarily focuses on monitoring field visits during the past time period, as well as the proceedings of the Second Plenary Session, the consensus decisions and recommendations made by the individual Working Groups behind closed doors, and the role of the consensus committee.

Since the NDC commenced on March 18 through the time period ending in the completion of this report, the National Dialogue Conference Secretariat has not been cooperative in addressing some of the difficulties and challenges that have been hindering the Coalition members' access to the conference hall and to relevant information.

For instance, the NDC Secretariat complicated the job of RASD Coalition members by denying them access permissions to monitor the closed sessions of the individual Working Groups under the pretext that Working Group heads refused to accept observers. However, during meetings with the coalition leadership, the Working Groups members and heads warmly welcomed any observer to watch the dialogue process.

During the Second Plenary Session, only one observer was allowed to enter the session's hall under the pretext that such an event does not need more than one observer, and that a single observer would be enough to monitor the event.

Despite all the NDC Secretariat-created obstacles in delaying the issuance of access permissions [accreditation badges] to observers, the RASD Coalition, which is keen to strengthen transparency and integrity, adopted a number of means to obtain information and permits, which have been recently granted by the NDC Secretariat to the Coalition to have access to some of the Working Groups. The Coalition also was concerned with enabling citizens to be informed about the proceedings of the NDC, thus increasing community involvement, participation and enhancing transparency and integrity.



Objectives of the Report

The RASD Coalition for Monitoring the National Dialogue Conference was formed to monitor the procedures of the National Dialogue Conference. The Coalition believes that it represents the people of Yemen in monitoring the Conference and in sharing information with the public. It also believes that its involvement makes the NDC more transparent and increases the citizen participation.

This report, which is the third one by RASD Coalition, focuses on monitoring events related to the field visits made by the five NDC Working Groups which RASD monitors that is the Southern Issue, Sa'ada Issue, Issues of National Dimension and Transitional Justice, State Building and Good Governance between May 7 and July 8, 2013. The report also focuses on observing proceedings of the Second Plenary Session.

In its first and second reports, the RASD Coalition commended the NDC's launch as per the determined schedule and highlighted other successes of the Conference, including completion of the legal quorum for the plenary session and promoting the transparency during that process.

The Coalition focused on activities of the selected five Working Groups and how committed the Working Groups have been to the procedures [ground rules] such as the legal quorum for meetings, attendance of the delegates and the role of the main entities such as the Standards and Discipline Committee, the Consensus Committee, NDC Presidium and NDC Secretariat during this period. The report provides comments on the level of citizen and community participation and the impact of communication and outreach activities.

Main components of the report:

The report contains details about the five Working Groups' field visits to provinces and state institutions, as well as the session proceedings and consensus decisions made by the Working Groups. It also provides comments on the level of citizen and community participation through field visits, plus observers' comments on the Working Groups' closed meetings.

The report records the training workshops provided to Conference delegates, protests staged by some delegates and activities of the NDC Secretariat. It also summarizes the events that took place outside the conference halls and the proceedings and decisions of the Second Plenary Session, highlights the NDC's media outreach, works of the Standards and Discipline Committee and the Consensus Committee, and contains information about the attendance and absence of delegates



from the different participating entities throughout the period covered by the report, which witnessed 41 meetings, as shown by an explanatory schedule.

Key Findings:

- Successes
- The Second Plenary Session was launched at the Presidential Palace on Saturday, June 8.
 The inaugural day featured an informational video on the first 80 days of the dialogue, plus the actions of the various Working Groups. The session included delegate presentations on the nine Working Groups' reports, which contained the results, draft decisions and recommendations made by the individual Working Groups.
- The five Working Groups' final reports for the first phase, which contained a number of consensus decisions, were presented and forwarded to the [second] plenary session for approval.
- The final meeting of the NDC Second Plenary Session was concluded on Monday, July 8, after reading the final report for the previous phase, which involved decisions of all the NDC Working Groups, except for those Working Groups concerned with the Southern Issue, the Sa'ada Issue and State Building.
- The President of the Republic issued the Presidential Decree No. 41 of 2013 on the formation of the NDC Consensus Committee, which is made up of the NDC Presidium, Working Group leaders and six NDC delegates. This committee is responsible for building consensus among Working Group members about controversial or disputed issues, making suggestions on resolving any standing disagreements, consulting with delegates and entities about disputed issues to bring a consensus opinion, coordinating outcomes of the various Working Groups, following up implementation of the NDC decisions and ensuring that such decisions are enforced once the NDC process is over.
- The Second Plenary Session is a series of presentational meetings during which NDC delegates presented their comments and expressed their opinions about the issue in question. There have been no decisions or debates as the meetings were similar to public hearings.

• Shortcomings and opportunities for improvement

 During the field visits, more emphasis was placed on holding meetings with government and party leaders, and there have been no communications or meetings with the public and ordinary citizens Therefore, citizens have not been able to have access to information,



nor have they been able to voice their concerns. The NDC delegates met with government and party figures with the aim of identifying the surrounding circumstances [citizen concerns], but what they actually did contradicts the plan, which stressed the necessity of meeting ordinary citizens, affected Yemenis and others. The NDC field visits contradicted the principles and objectives of citizen participation.

- Unlike the first phase, the second NDC phase has not seen extensive media coverage, according to RASD Coalition observations.
- Through the Coalition observations, it has been found that the NDC Secretariat's website focuses on marginal [unimportant] matters rather than on the actual actions and procedures of the dialogue process or what information is sought by citizens and interested individuals. The website lacks important information and data. Also, the media activities and means adopted by the NDC Secretariat have been lacking citizen participation.
- Only three Working Groups have conducted field visits. Namely, they are: State Building Working Group, Good Governance Working Group and Issues of National Dimension & Transitional Justice Working Group. The Southern Issue Working Group has not made any field visits because the group members received no response regarding implementation of the 20-recommendation list, which was developed to build mutual trust between the group members and the would-be visited citizens. The group members are insisting not to make any field visits unless the implementation of the 20-recommendation list concerning the southern issue commences in order to build mutual confidence between themselves and citizens, particularly the southerners, which is key to aiding their field visits. On the other hand, the Sa'ada Issue Working Group has not conducted the planned field visits due to a delay in the schedule development. The group members have not agreed on the field visit dates. The group's procedure stipulates completion of the debate of the root causes and content of the issue as a foundation for conducting field visits, but this was hindered by the numerous disagreements and differences among members of the group.

Introduction

Based on its strong faith in serving the homeland by monitoring the dialogue process and its adherence to embodying the principles of good governance and community participation, the RASD Coalition took initiative to contribute to this important event which would chart the future of Yemen.



Despite all the NDC Secretariat-created obstacles that delayed obtaining accreditation badges for observers, the RASD Coalition, which is careful about strengthening transparency and integrity, adopted a number of means to obtain information and permits, which have been recently granted by NDC Secretariat to the Coalition to have access to some of the Working Groups. The Coalition also was concerned with enabling citizens to be informed about the proceedings of the NDC, thus increasing community involvement, participation and enhancing transparency and integrity.

The RASD Coalition has followed the NDC since its launch and monitored its proceedings and sessions. Today, the Coalition issues its third report, covering the period from May 7 to May 8, which was the concluding day of the Second Plenary Session.

This report monitors events related to the NDC field visits during a sensitive stage of the NDC that is related to citizens, thus increasing the involvement of citizens to express their opinions and viewpoints and to contribute to charting the progress of building a new Yemen.

The report contains proceedings of the Second Plenary Session, which is midway on the path towards achieving the NDC's objectives. The upcoming phase will be critical and RASD is determined to work hard to help promote the integrity and transparency of the procedures towards building new Yemen.

NDC Issues Monitored by RASD Coalition:

- The Southern Issue
- The Sa'ada Issue
- Issues of National Dimension and Transitional Justice
- State Building
- Good Governance

First: The Southern Issue Working Group

 Tuesday, May 7: A number of independent NDC delegates presented their viewopinions about the root causes of the Southern Issue before the relevant Working Group. Two viewtheories were presented by Balquis al-Lahabi and Amani al-Makhadhi from the Independent Women Entity, and another twoview were presented by Nasser Sharif from



the independent youth and Ali Abdu Rabo al-Qadhi [an independent delegate from the President's List].

- **Tuesday, May 7**: The Ambassador of Germany to Yemen Mr. Holger Green met with the Southern Issue Working Group.
- Wednesday, May 8: The Southern Issue Working Group approved a schedule for the NDC's participating entities to present their individual viewviews about the content [root causes] of the Southern Issue. Three days from that date, the participating entities would begin presenting their own views. The participants agreed on the necessity of abiding by the presentation standards (objectivity, approach and facts), putting more emphasis on certain dimensions (political, economic, developmental, right and legal content), and making the presentation brief without sacrificing content. The participants also agreed to suspend the field visits, which were scheduled to take place on May 14, until further notice following the presentations viewabout the content [root causes] of the issue.
- Wednesday, May 8: Ahmad Kalaz, an NDC delegate, presented the Yemeni Unionist
 Congregation Party's view about the Southern Issue's content before the relevant Working
 Group.
- Sunday, May 12: Mohammed al-Afif presented the Nasserite Unionist Popular
 Organization's view about the Southern Issue content before the relevant Working Group.
 On the same day, NDC delegate Ali Hussein Ashal presented Islah Party's view about the
 Southern Issue content before the relevant Working Group.
- **Monday, May 13**: The Minister of Interior spoke before the Southern Issue Working Group about assassinations and the targeting of the President and demonstrators.
- **Monday, May 13**: Yasser al-Awadhi, an NDC delegate, presented the General People's Congress (GPC) view about the Southern Issue content before the relevant Working Group.
- **Tuesday, May 14**: Both Rashad Union and National Alliance presented their views about the Southern Issue content via NDC delegate Nasser al-Nessairi.
- Wednesday, May 15: Justice & Building Party presented to the Working Group its view about the Southern Issue.
- Wednesday, May 15: The Working Group listened to a presentation by NDC delegate Saadaddin Bin Talib about political, financial and administrative corruption, and the reasons behind the emergence of many right, political and social problems, which are, according to him, inevitable consequences of rampant corruption in all the government bodies.



- For the Period of May 7 -July 8, 2013
- Sunday, May 19: The Working Group listened to views presented by Ansarollah [Houthis], Youth, Women and CSOs about the Southern Issue Content.
 The Ansarollah's view was presented by Mahmoud Abdulqader al-Junaid.
 The Independent Women's view was presented by Amani Ahmad al-Makhadhi.
 The Independent Youth's view was presented by Nasser Ahmad Sharif.
 Another Independent Youth's view was presented by Nadia al-Akhram.
- **Monday, May 20**: Ali al-Mamari presented the National Council of Revolutionary Forces' view about the Southern Issue.
- Monday, May 27: The Working Group listened to a presentation by Researcher Abriel Aly, Representative of the International Crisis Management Group, about the Southern Issue Report: Point of collapse and relevant aspects, an analytical reading of a report prepared by the researcher. The presentation also touched upon the developments that happened in Yemen in general and the South in particular in the post-report period.
- Wednesday, May 29: The Working Group listened to a presentation by NDC delegate Jameela Ali Raja in which she reviewed the findings of a field study prepared by her under the title "Political Parties' and Groups' initial attitudes towards the structure of governance" (centralization, decentralization or federalism).
- Saturday, June 1: The Working Group assigned a subgroup [derived from the group] to continue debating the conclusions concerning the Southern Issue, as well as the conclusions concerning community participation. On the same day, the group debated a series of relevant issues such as the murder of Ahmad al-Marqashi, an al-Ayyam Newspaper Guard, attendance and discipline of the group members, what has been accomplished in the implementation of the 11 recommendation list, which is intended to promote mutual trust [between the group members and target citizens], and follow up with Yemeni Theologians Committee concerning a written essay, attributed to the committee spokesman.
- **Sunday, June 2**: The Working Group approved the final draft of its progress report for the period April 1 June 1, 2013.
- Monday, June 3: The Working Group continued its meetings on the final draft of the report for the period April 1 – June 1. The draft was enriched with different comments on its content. The Working Group formed a team from its members to develop its action plan for the next period. Representing the different NDC entities, the team included Tamam Ba-Sharahil, Abdullah Numan, Ali Shalama, Qadri Ahmad Haidar, Nabeel Basha, Abdurrazaq al-Hejri and Ali Behaider.



- **Tuesday, June 4**: The Working Group finished debating and approved the final report, covering the different themes and topics included in the views presented by the NDC-represented entities.
- Wednesday, June 5: A final report on the root causes and content of the Southern Issue, submitted by an assigned subgroup, was not approved due to incomplete quorum.
- Tuesday, June 17: The Working Group decided to refer its final report on the root causes and content of the Southern Issue to the Consensus Committee to help resolve the differences form a unified view on the issue, following a GPC objection, presented by Ahmad Obaid Bin Daghr, who provided14 comments on some of the terms and facts, contained in the concluding report of the content and root causes.

Through its observations of these events, RASD Coalition noticed the following:

- Previous meeting minutes are read out at the beginning of each meeting every day. If there
 are proposed changes to some of the meetings, they are normally made following
 agreement among the group members. Then, the report is reprinted and passed out to the
 group members.
- The group members come at different times. Therefore, the group's meetings, on average, begin at 9:30 a.m. and the members leave at 1:00 p.m. At this point, it has been noticed that the members are not committed to the specified working hours. Therefore, many relevant issues are usually adjourned for next sessions.
- It has been noticed during the report period that the group presents an agenda of certain topics for debate per meeting, but a meeting covers, on average, around 80 percent of the topics contained in the agenda. The rest of the topics are postponed for next meetings.
- The absence of group members from meetings during the report period has been rated at
 6 percent on average, and most of the absentees had excuses.
- The Working Group has not made any field visits during the report period because the group members received no response regarding implementation of the 20-recommendation list, which was developed to rebuild mutual trust between the group members and the would-be visited citizens. The group members are insisting to not make any field visits unless the implementation of the 20-recommendation list concerning the Southern Issue commences in order to build mutual confidence between themselves and citizens, particularly the southerners, which is key to aiding their field visits.

Second: The Sa'ada Issue Working Group



- Wednesday, May 8: The Working Group's meeting on that day experienced wide argument as some of the group members insisted to suspend work until two deputies and a rapporteur for the group are elected, claiming theirs was the only group without complete presidium [presidency board]. Some members suggested that the issue be reported to the NDC Presidium while others were of the opinion that the issue should be resolved by consensus within the group without waiting for a decision from the NDC Presidium on resolving the issue.
- Saturday, May 11: NDC delegates from the different entities, who are also members of the group, met with the NDC Presidium, informing it that the group made a consensus decision to refer to the NDC Presidium the unsettled issue [selection of the rest of the Group presidium members] for prompt consideration. They also informed the NDC Presidium that the Working Group was planning to suspend its work unless the issue of electing the rest of the Group presidium members was resolved within two days.
- Sunday, May 12: The NDC Presidium ended the controversy over the election of the Group presidium by appointing Abdulhamid Heraiz first deputy, Khalid Amin al-Ghaish second deputy, and Waheeb Hassan Khedabekhish rapporteur. Then, the group members unanimously agreed on the NDC decision.
- Monday, May 13: The Working Group debated the tasks of subordinate documentation and summarizing a subgroup in order to prepare a preliminary summary on the root causes of the Sa'ada Issue. The Working Group agreed that the represented political entities present on the day following their individual views about the target areas and groups [affected by the Sa'ada events] and provide suggestions for field visits.
- Tuesday, May 14: The Working Group debated a number of relevant issue areas and selected next Saturday a date for submitting documentation on the root causes of the Sa'ada Issue. The Group's presidium was mandated to follow up NDC Secretariat to demand the relevant official authorities to provide the Group with relevant documentation on the Issue.
- **Tuesday, May 14**: The Working Group agreed with the target groups about the field visits to search for the root causes of the Issue.
- Wednesday, May 15: The Working Group listens to a report by the subgroup about citizen participation regarding the Sa'ada Issue. The subgroup reported it and received a number of citizens who participated and their and inputs via CSOs in Amran, Hajjah, Taiz and Sana'a provinces. The citizen participants were seeking workable solutions to the Sa'ada Issue, which is considered one of the most important topics in the NDC agenda.



- Wednesday, May 15: The Working Group listened to what had been agreed upon by the documentation & summarizing subgroup, as well as by all the target groups regarding the conduction of field visits and listing to concerns of target citizens. Then, the Working Group approved what had been accomplished by the subgroup in agreement with the following three target groups: War prisoners; people dismissed from their jobs before the first round of fighting; and district directors.
- Sunday, May 19: The Working Group debated the timing of public hearings for the target groups, and approved Saturday, the 25th of May, a date for commencing the public hearings, providing that the group members present written questions on the following day for debate and approval.
- Sunday, May 19: The Working Group listened to a presentation about a field visit report by the Transitional Justice Working Group on the conditions of internally displaced persons (IDPs) in Haradh district of Hajjah governorate. Presented by Bahria Shamsher, from the Transitional Justice Working Group, the report reviewed the conditions and suffering of IDPs, and shared a list of recommendations to address their problems.
- **Monday, May 20**: the documentation & summarizing subgroup convened to debate the final changes to the Working Group's view on the root causes of Sa'ada issue. The view was planned to be submitted by the subgroup on the following day, Tuesday.
- Tuesday, May 21: The documentation & summarizing subgroup submitted a final summary on political entities' views about the root causes of Sa'ada Issue. On the same day, the Working Group members watched a documentary film highlighting the suffering of Sa'ada people after six rounds of fighting in their province.
- **Saturday, May 25**: At a meeting chaired by its leaders Nabeela al-Zubair, the Working Group completed debating a summary on the root causes of the issue, which was developed by the subgroup.
- **Monday, May 27**: Minutes of the previous day's meeting were reviewed, and the summary of views on the root causes of the Sa'ada issue was completed and presented.
- **Tuesday, May 28**: The Working Group members made a brief presentation about community participation. They also presented the political entities' views on the content of the Sa'ada Issue, and completed debate and presentation of the root causes of the Issue.
- Wednesday, May 29: The Working Group listened to testimonies about the root causes of Sa'ada Issue, and then read out and approved the final report on the root causes of the Issue.



- Wednesday, May 29: Hussein Hazeb, a member of the group, protested that the Working Group leadership and NDC Secretariat had not provided them with requested documents regarding the root cause of the Issue. Also, Mabkhut al-Sharif, another group member, objected to the adjournment of the final report approval for the next Saturday, saying the group presidium is not committed to time limits.
- **Saturday, June 1**: The final report for the first period was reviewed, debated and approved, and the public hearing plan was reviewed as well. The same day saw concluding debates on a final draft of specific terms for the root causes of the Sa'ada Issue.
- Sunday, June 2: The Working Group debated and reviewed its itinerary on field visits to Sa'ada, and presented condolences on the demise of Martyr Hussein Badraddin al-Houthi¹, according their description, to family members of the deceased. It also formed a committee from NDC-participating entities and target groups to draft an itinerary for field visits.
- Monday, June 3: All political entities involved in the Working Group presented their views about the content of the Sa'ada Issue. Representatives of Rashad Union, GPC, Islah, Nasserite Organization, Yemeni Socialist Party, Union of Popular Forces Ansarollah, women and youth groups read out their respective entities' views about the Sa'ada Issue. At a meeting chaired by deputy leader Abdulhamid Heraiz, the Working Group agreed to refer views to a committee formed from all political entities and the group presidium to produce a summarized draft of all the views, and then present it to the Working Group's first meeting after the Second Plenary Session.
- **Tuesday, June 4**: Socialist party, Nasserite Unionist Popular Organization, and Union of Popular Forces presented a joint view on the content of the Sa'ada Issue.
- Wednesday, June 5: Ansarollah, Southern Movement [Hirak], Islah Party, youth, and women groups presented their views on the content of Sa'ada Issue.

Through its observations of these events, RASD Coalition noticed the following:

- The Working Group begins its daily meetings 40 minutes later than the scheduled time (9:00 a.m.); which means they convene at about 9:40 a.m. and leave at 1:30 p.m. (on average). It is noticed that the Working Group leaves the meeting hall 30 minutes earlier than the scheduled time (2:00 p.m.).

¹ Houthi leader Hussein Badraddin al-Houthi was reportedly killed by the army in September 2004, but his corpse was discovered and buried in a huge funeral procession on June 2, 2013.

- The Working Group does not review its previous meeting agenda / topics on a daily basis.
 During the report period, one could say that 80 percent of the previous meeting minutes have been read out at the beginning of meetings.
- It has been noticed during the report period that the group presents an agenda of certain topics for debate per meeting, but a meeting covers, on average, around 70 percent of the topics contained in the agenda. The rest of the topics are postponed for future meetings.
- The absence of group members from meetings during the report period has been rated at 15 percent on average, and most of the absentees belong to the President's list [delegates selected by President of the Republic].
- The Working Group does not respect time limits and order. The delegates keep going in and out during meetings.
- After the break, many of the group members return later than the scheduled time. It has been noticed that some members return one and a half hours late.
- The Working Group lacked community participation and its field visits have been postponed more than once due to incomplete views on the root causes and content of the Sa'ada Issue. Previous views have not been summarized, nor have the topics been debated according to the schedule. The suspension of the group's field visits is considered an obstacle to community participation.

Third: Issues of National Dimension & Transitional Justice Working Group

- Tuesday, May 7: The Working Group reviewed and debated the NDC Presidium's letter and field visit itineraries. It agreed to outsource experts to debate the draft transitional justice law, saying the draft should be withhold and should not be presented to Parliament. Also, members of the group agreed to refer regular absentees to the Standards and Discipline Committee.
- Wednesday, May 8: The Working Group made organizational comments and held a meeting for members who would be conducting field visits to Taiz to coordinate requirements and logistics of field visits. The group agreed to receive any views presented in the name of any of the NDC participating entities, but not in the name of any individual delegates.
- Saturday, May 11: The Working Group discussed the reasons for the adjournment of the scheduled field visits to Aden and Abyan. A field visit was made to Taiz province during which the group members met with local authority staff, governorate leadership and CSO representatives. The Subgroup on Reclaiming Looted Property conducted a field visit to the



Supreme National Authority on Combating Corruption (SNACC). Also, the IDP subgroup presented a report on the conditions of IDPs.

- Tuesday, May 14: Subgroups on forced disappeared persons, terrorism fighting and political conflicts conducted field visits to the Ministry of Human Rights and were briefed by the ministry about the negative and positive aspects of the draft transitional justice law. The Working Group listened to a presentation by Dr. Mohammed al-Mekhlafi, Legal Affairs Minister, about transitional justice.
- **Sunday, May 19**: The Subgroup on 2011 Human Rights Violations conducted a field visit to the [UN] HighCommissioner on Human Rights.
- **Monday, May 27**: A subgroup was formed to discuss the Working Group's report and make comments, suggestions and additions thereto.
- **Sunday, June 2**: The Working Group debated its final report, which was planned to be presented to NDC Second Plenary Session.
- **Monday, June 3**: The Working Group debated a number of topics with the aim of enriching its report and ensuring consensus among all members.
- **Tuesday, June 4**: The Working Group agreed on its final report and submitted it to the [NDC] presidium.
- Wednesday, June 5: Relevant subgroups held a session to debate and assess the progress of the past period in light of the final report, approved by the Working Group. The subgroups reviewed the completed actions according to the plan, and the mechanism of resuming work after the Second Plenary Session.

Through its observations of these events, RASD Coalition noticed the following:

- The Working Group begins its daily meetings 20 minutes later than the scheduled time (9:00 a.m.); which means they convene at about 9:20 a.m. and leave at 1:00 p.m. (on average). It is noticed that the Working Group leaves the meeting hall one hour earlier than the scheduled time (2:00 p.m.).
- The Working Group does not read out its previous meeting agenda / topics in most of the meetings covered by this report.
- It has been noticed during the report period that the group presents an agenda of certain topics for debate per meeting, but a meeting covers, on average, around 70 percent of the topics contained in the agenda. The rest of the topics are postponed for future meetings.



Also, the Working Group has failed to agree on most of the discussion topics, and delegates from other Working Groups come to participate in the debates of this Working Group.

- When it comes to the level of attendance, it has been noticed that 6 people, on average, have been absent per meeting. Most of the absentees belong to the President's list [delegates selected by President of the Republic]. In addition, all the late comers and most of the absentees have not justified their late coming or absence, nor has the Group leadership asked them about the reasons for their late coming or absence.
- During the field visits, more emphasis was placed on holding meetings with government and party leaders, and there have been no communications or meetings with the public and ordinary citizens. Therefore, citizens have not been able to have access to information, nor have they been able to voice their concerns. The Working Group members met with government and party figures with the aim of identifying the surrounding circumstances [citizen concerns], but what they actually did contradicts the plan, which stressed the necessity of meeting ordinary citizens, affected Yemenis and others. The Working Group's field visits contradicted the principles and objectives of citizen participation.
- Although the objectives of field visits are to promote community participation and involve all citizens in the dialogue process, the field visits conducted by the group have not achieved even a minimum level of objectives, as their visits have been limited to government groups, and some political figures and elites. The group members have not made any visits to target groups or areas that really embody the suffering and concerns of ordinary citizens.

Fourth: State Building Working Group

- **Wednesday, May 8**: The Working Group reviewed the rest of working papers presented by the different political entities about the most appropriate electoral system for Yemen.
- **Saturday, May 11**: The Working Group reviewed working papers submitted by Ansarollah, YSP and GPC about the structure of the state.
- **Tuesday, May 14**: The NDC-participating entities presented working papers on the legislature. The same day saw the presentation of a report on a field visit by the Working Group to the Sabaeen dialogue tent.
- Wednesday, May 15: The Working Group reviewed and debated the NDC entities' views on the legislature, and made a field visit to Sana'a University.
- **Sunday, May 19**: Other views on the legislature and judiciary were presented.



- **Sunday, May 26**: Reports on field visits to Taiz, Ibb, Mahrah and the capital city were submitted.
- **Tuesday, May 28:** The Supreme Judicial Council's view on the judiciary was presented.
- Saturday, June 1: The Working Group submitted a final report to the NDC presidium to be presented before the Second Plenary Session. The group also listened to a complementary view from Aden Community Council, which was submitted by Khalid Mohammed Numan. The view focused on the administrative, economic and legislative structure of the state, as well as the army and security structure in the constitution, and financial reconciliations between the federal government and regions under federalism, which is one of the NDC's proposed outcomes. On the same day, the Working Group listened to the Southern Movement's view on the state building themes, and a subgroup was formed from all the NDC entities to develop the Working Group's action plan for the post-Second Plenary Session period. Also, representatives for the Working Group met with Attorney-General Abdullah al-Awash and debated the conditions of young revolutionaries in detention for more than two years.
- **Sunday, June 2**: The Working Group debated a draft action plan for the post-Second Plenary Session period.
- Monday, June 3: The Working Group approved an action plan for the next two months following the Second Plenary Session and made necessary changes to the plan. The group discussed the general objectives and working mechanisms, and agreed on general determinants and principles of the Constitution and the incorporation of all Working Groups' proviews, after the Second Plenary Session, in the Constitutional Principles and Foundations. It also reviewed the Second Plenary Session's decisions, and which of them would serve as constitutional principles and foundations in order to be reworded and incorporated into the Constitution as per their relation with the State Building themes. In addition, the group debated the incorporation of draft laws into the Constitutional Foundations and Principles.
- **Tuesday, June 4**: The Working Group completed development of its action plan for the next period.

Through its observations of these events, RASD Coalition noticed the following:

 The Working Group begins its daily meetings 30 minutes later than the scheduled time (9:00 a.m.) but leave at 2:30 p.m. (on average). This time extension by 30 minutes cause rage among members of the group, who want to leave at 2:00 p.m.





- The Working Group reads out its previous meeting agenda/topics in most of the meetings covered by this report.
- It has been noticed during the report period that the group presents an agenda of certain topics for debate per meeting, but a meeting covers, on average, around 80 percent of the topics contained in the agenda. The rest of the topics are postponed for future meetings.
- When it comes to the level of attendance, members' absenteeism has been rated at 15 percent. Most of the absentees belong to the President's list [delegates selected by President of the Republic].
- The Working Group's field visits have not complied with the plan, as most of the visits were conducted randomly without including the target groups stated in the plan.
- The Working Group's field visits experienced conflict over team leader posts. Members of the group failed to agree about who will be leading the field teams, which was negatively reflected on the management of field visits.
- The field teams, derived from this Working Group, lacked the required data about the target groups. Therefore, they conducted their visits according to whatever information had been obtained by the Working Group, or through interpersonal relations.
- During the field visits, more emphasis was placed on holding meetings with government and party leaders, and there have been no communications or meetings with the public and ordinary citizens. Therefore, citizens have not been able to have access to information, nor have they been able to voice their concerns and experiences. The Working Group members obtained information through meeting with public and public figures, thus contradicting the principles of citizen participation.
- Also, the discussion style, which has been adopted by Working Group was not adequately appropriate. For instance, one of the targeted citizens wanted to express his opinion about a particular issue, but one of the group members interrupted him and said "You are not allowed to speak about this." However, the main job of the group members was to listen to the public and make inquiries, as stated by the field visit objectives.
- Although the objectives of field visits are to promote community participation and involve all citizens in the national dialogue process, the field visits conducted by the group have not achieved even a minimum level of objectives, as their visits have been limited to government groups, and some political figures and elites. The field visits have not touched upon the concerns and suffering of ordinary citizens.



- It has been noticed that one of the group members has been passive most of the time.
 Although that member has not participated effectively in the group's discussion, his poor performance was not reported [to the Standards & Discipline Committee].
- According to some of the Working Group members, the field visit report has been built on other members' personal opinions, and that it has not included diverse inputs from the public, or that the report has been built on biased field visits. Moreover, some group members tended to adjust citizens' inputs in whatever manner they wanted before incorporating them into the report.

Fifth: The Good Governance Working Group

- Tuesday, May 7: The subgroups, derived from the Good Governance Working Group, began their field visits to the capital city, and decided to meet the Party Affairs Committee, House of Representatives, and Ministries of Planning & International Cooperation (MoPIC) and Social Affairs and Labor (MoSAL).
- **Tuesday, May 7**: The Subgroup on Transparency & Combating Corruption conducted a field visit to the Ministry of Oil and Minerals.
- Wednesday, May 8: The Working Group's presidium finished final arrangements with the NDC Secretariat for subgroup visits to provinces. A number of relevant teams made field visits to the provinces of Aden, Taiz and Hadramout.
- Wednesday, May 8: The Subgroup on Party and CSO Roles conducted a field visit to the Party Affairs Committee, during which it reviewed performance of the committee and the level of transparency in its work.
- **Saturday, May 11**: The Subgroup on Party and CSO Roles held a meeting with parliamentary caucus leaders.
- **Sunday, May 12**: The Subgroup on Transparency and Combating Corruption held a meeting with leadership of the Yemeni Economic Corporation.
- Sunday, May 12: The Working Group was briefed about the MoPIC's mechanism of work with CSOs, the accommodation of grants and distribution of projects. It also met leaders of the Control and Audit, and Real Estate Authority.
- Monday, May 13: The Subcommittee on Party and CSO Roles met with the Shoura Council's Freedoms and Human Rights Committee, and debated freedom-related issues. The subgroup on Transparency and Combating Corruption conducted a field visit to the Supreme Tender Committee.

- Tuesday, May 14: Many members from the rights and freedoms and good governance
 Working Groups visited MoSAL to review progress of work in the ministry, and identify the organizational structure and obstacles to service delivery.
- **Tuesday, May 14**: Minister of Finance reviewed performance of his ministry before the Subgroup on Transparency and Combating Corruption.
- Wednesday, May 15: During its field visit to the Hadramout governorate, the Working Group met representatives of the National Women's Committee and a number of female activists.
- Wednesday, May 15: The Subgroup on Transparency and Combating Corruption conducted a field visit to the Customs Authority, and met the authority chairperson and deputies.
- Monday, May 20: A team from the Working Group reviewed situations in the Central bank of Yemen (CBY), and the monetary policy followed by CBY, plus the obstacles and which future vision could be presented by the CBY management to NDC for the purpose of contributing to formulating effective financial and monetary policies in the new Yemen.
- Tuesday, May 21: The Subgroup on Justice and Equal Opportunity made a visit to the Supreme Judicial Council during which both sides debated the necessary means for realizing the NDC outcomes related with judiciary and justice system.
- Saturday, May 25: The three subgroups (Party and CSO Roles, Justice & Equal Opportunity, and Transparency & Combating Corruption) began debating the working mechanism and regulations for analyzing the information they obtained during their field visits over the past days.
- Sunday, May 26: The Working Group-affiliated subgroups finished formulating their plans on provisions that should be contained in the current Constitution, depending on the outcomes of their field visits and the findings of studies and public hearings conducted over the past period.
- Sunday, May 26: The three subgroups individually debated a number of working papers on field visits and approved draft legal provisions concerning guarantees that disallow corruption in public institutions, the roles of parties and CSOs, support outlets, accountability, oversight, women's political empowerment, sustainable development and civil service.
- Monday, May 27: The Subgroup on Transparency and Combating Corruption submitted a report to the Working Group leadership, which was subsequently incorporated into the Working Group's Report and delivered to the NDC Presidium.





- Tuesday, May 28: The Working Group discussed the three subgroup reports and then incorporated them into a consistent report reflecting the views and proposals of the Working Group members on some of the provisions to be contained in the new Constitution, as per requirements of the modern civil state and good governance. It also approved constitutional outcomes for the two subgroups on Party & CSO Roles and Justice & Equal Opportunity, following a vote on them.
- Wednesday, May 29: The Working Group finished debate and voted on the contents of its final report and relevant constitutional proposals. The debate touched upon a number of issues, complying with principles of good governance. The draft constitutional articles, proposed by the group members, have been inclusive; leaving no gaps that could be exploited to pass on private concerns in the event such articles are incorporated into the new Constitution. Some proposed provisions have been modified and others deleted during the debate.

The Proposed constitutional provisions focused on the following:

- Disallowing practice of trade by senior officials, and private ownership of public property and resources.
- No immunity for any public officials practicing corruption.
- No taxes, customs and other duties may be levied, but such which shall be by law; the waste of oil company production operations and their impacts on the environment and people; and the approval of accountability in extractive industries.
- Wednesday, May 29: A diplomatic delegation involving the ambassadors of Malaysia, Indonesia and Pakistan visited the Working Group, praising members of the group for democratically debating topics in their agenda.
- **Sunday, June 2**: The Working Group approved its final report.
- Monday, June 3: The Working Group began discussing its action plan for the post-Second Plenary Session period, and agreed to divide its members into three subgroups and distribute to them the group's tasks for the next period. The division came as follows: Subgroup on Competence of Public Administration & Checks and Balances; Subgroup on Rule of Law; and Subgroup on Foreign Policy Principles. The members of each subgroup were named.
- Tuesday, June 4: The three subgroups, derived from the Working Group, held their first meeting and debated their action plans for the next period, involving the objectives and necessary activities to produce outcomes complying with good governance requirements.





Each individual subgroup selected a leader and a rapporteur from among its members as follows:

The Subgroup on Rule of Law selected Mukhtar Awaidh to serve as the subgroup leader and Fatima Qahtan as a rapporteur.

The Subgroup on Competence of Public Administration & Checks and Balances selected Fayza al-Mutawakul to serve as the subgroup leader and Faisal al-Khelaifi as a rapporteur. The Subgroup on Foreign Policy Principles selected Mubarak al-Bahhar to serve as the subgroup leader and Khadija Elawah as a rapporteur.

The members were distributed to the subgroups according to their individual interests, and the subgroup composition came as follows:

The Subgroup on Rule of Law was made up of 13 members.

The Subgroup on Competence of Public Administration & Checks and Balances was made up of 17 members.

The Subgroup on Foreign Policy Principles was made up of 20 members.

Through its observations of these events, RASD Coalition noticed the following:

- The Good Governance Working Group's members start their sessions at 9:30 a.m. as the earliest time. Some sessions covered by this report started at 10:00 a.m. This is a violation and noncompliance with the scheduled time. On average, the Working Group finished at 1:30 p.m. This is also a violation and not compliant with time, as the sessions are supposed to end at 2:00 p.m. However, this Working Group has the favorable characteristic of making up for the time loss by taking their break while doing their activities at the same time. They take their food and return to their seats.
- The previous minutes are read aloud on daily basis. The agenda is approved by the Working Group's subcommittee. The agenda is then observed and applied.
- Concerning the absence for this Working Group during the period covered by this report, the absence rate is up to 13%. The number of absentees in this Working Group differs from entity to entity.
- The Good Governance Working Group conducted field visits to a number of provinces, most notably the Capital City of Sana'a, Taiz, and Hadhramout.
- While visiting the governmental departments and ministries, the Working Group's subgroups targeted the ministers and undersecretaries, and the negligence of the officers who are the main target of the field visits. RASD Coalition thinks that there is no problem in meeting the ministers and undersecretaries. However, they should be a part of the



objective and not to be the objective itself. Therefore, as one member said, the ministers and undersecretaries are most often drawing a rosy picture of the harsh reality.

 Sources have told RASD Coalition that the Working Group's Field Visit Plan was not applied fully. There remains about 35% unfinished. There were a number of reasons for this, most important of which are the obstacles presented by the Secretariat. Some members said that it had not prearranged and coordinated with the target departments in advance before the visits.

Field Visits

 Tuesday, May 7: The NDC Secretariat held an extensive meeting chaired by Dr. Ahmed Awadh bin Mubarak, and attended by First Deputy Dr. Afrah Al-Zoubah, and the Second Deputy Yasser Al-Ru'aini to discuss the field visits of the NDC Working Groups.

The meeting approved the division of the field groups' work centers into six areas: The first of which is Aden (including Aden, Abyan, Lahj, Al-Dhale', and Al-Baidha'); the second is Hadhramout (including Al-Mukalla, Seyoun, Mahra, Shabwa, and Socotra); the third is Taiz (including Taiz and Ibb); the fourth is the Capital City (including Sana'a, Mahweet, Amran, Dhamar, Mareb, and Al-Jawf); the fifth is Hodeidah (including Hodeidah, Hajja and Raima); and the sixth is Sa'ada (including the Sa'ada Province). The meeting approved the commencement of field visits in their areas which are Taiz, Hadhramout, and the Capital City.

- **Saturday, May 11:** Members from the NDC Good Governance, State-Building and Transitional Justice Working Groups met the local authority representatives in Taiz, as part of the NDC Working Groups' field visits to provinces.
- Saturday, May 11: There was a night session involving the NDC field visit groups (Good Governance, State Building and Transitional Justice) and representatives of civil society organizations in the city of Taiz. They elaborately discussed a number of issues and problems suffered in Taiz, most of which focused on the security situation and the loss of the image of the State.
- **Sunday, May 12:** The field visit subgroups (Transitional Justice, Good Governance, and State-Building) held a meeting with the leaders of parties and political organizations in Taiz province, which was devoted to the discussion of the parties' views of the three issues and their comments on the situation in Taiz province.
- **Monday, May 13:** the field visit subgroups (NDC Good Governance, State Building, and Transitional Justice) met the community of Taiz University including academics, male and



female students and officers. At the beginning, they listened to an account by the University's leadership of the overall concerns and issues suffered by the University.

- Monday, May 13: As part of the field visits conducted by the subgroups of the NDC Working Groups to the departments and provinces, the subgroups of Good Governance, Sustainable Development, and Independent Entities, met in Mukalla the rector and staff of the Hadhramout University for Science & Technology.
- **Tuesday, May 14:** The field subgroups were examining the situations in the sectors of health, education, oil, social affairs, civil service, and fisheries in Hadhramout. The subgroups are from the Good Governance, Sustainable Development, and Independent Entities Working Groups.

RASD Coalition thinks that the joint visits by these subgroups aim at creating integration among the Working Groups. The objectives of some Working Groups cannot be achieved unless they cooperate with other Working Groups. For example, as noted above, when the Good Governance Working Group conducted a visit to the health sector, they tried to see the extent of corruption. The Sustainable Development Working Group would also identify the development requirements for this sector and the reasons that hamper its development; the Independent Entities Working Group would study the feasibility of making this entity independent and the relevant requirements. Therefore, it can be said that the objective of each Working Group cannot be met if the other Working Group is not there.

- Tuesday, May 14: The NDC Transitional Justice, Good Governance and State-Building subgroups met in Taiz a number of NGO representatives and persons whose rights were violated by armed persons supporting the revolutionaries. They also met many marginalized people.
- Wednesday, May 15: The NDC Good Governance, Sustainable Development and Independent Entities subgroups met, while in Mukalla, the officials of the Hadhramout Chamber of Commerce, businessmen, and contractors to get to know the main problems, concerns and obstacles faced by businessmen and investors.
- Tuesday, May 21st: The representatives of the State-Building, Good Governance, and Sustainable Development Working Groups met the local authority and executive office representatives in Mahra province. At the meeting, a number of problems, difficulties and obstacles in the province were discussed.
- Many citizens complained about the field visits conducted by the NDC Working Groups, explaining their performance and how the visited entities and personalities were selected



and that the members were imposing their opinions on others and involving the partisan and political conflicts.

Training Courses for the NDC members

- **Tuesday, May 7:** The NDC Secretariat, in coordination with NDI (The National Democratic Institute), organized a training course for 12 Working Group deputies on outreach and communication with the public and the media. The trainer was international expert Pamela Hart.
- **Tuesday, May 7:** The Southern Issue Working Group's members listened to a lecture by international expert Reno Herbert on the foundations of the State and the federal systems.
- Tuesday, May 7: The Transitional Justice Working Group listened to a lecture delivered by Moroccan expert Al-Siddeeq Al-Ahrash, which explained the enforced disappearances in Morocco and the entities that responded to the issue of enforced disappearances in Morocco.
- Wednesday, May 8: The Enforced Disappearances Working Group and the 2011 Violations subgroup of the Transitional Justice Working Group listened to Mrs. Lita Taylor of Human Rights Watch.
- Wednesday, May 8: The NDC Secretariat organized a training workshop for 30 participants from the Good Governance, State-Building, National Issues & Transitional Justice Working Groups, for the preparation of the field visit agenda.
- Wednesday, May 8: Some NDC Working Groups listened to a lecture on how to draft the constitution delivered by Mauritanian expert, Prof. of law at Taulaus University in France Mohammed Wald Labat.
- Wednesday, May 8: The NDC Secretariat organized a 3-day training course for a number of participants as a continuation of the Dialogue Ambassadors Program.
- **Saturday, May 11:** The NDC Secretariat Communication & Media Unit Director Mr. Mohammed Al-Asadi delivered a training presentation to the State-Building Working Group to facilitate the field visits.
- Wednesday, May 15: Turkish expert Mr. Mohammed Rafeeq delivered a lecture entitled "An Approach to the Constitution and its Importance" to the State-Building Working Group.
- **Tuesday June 11:** A symposium entitled "Youth Vision of Federalism" was conducted by French expert George Anderson, under the auspices of the UN, involving the NDC youth entity.



- Wednesday May 29: The State-Building Working Group listened to a lecture by Mauritanian expert Dr. Mohammed Wald Labat on "Democracy and Constitution."
- **Saturday, June 17**: Dr. Ehtesham Ahmed, expert on federalism and administrative and financial interrelations in governmental departments, delivered a lecture to NDC members entitled "Political Economy of Sharing Natural Resources Revenues: Yemen's Options".
- **Saturday, June 22nd:** A number of local and foreign experts reviewed the transitional justice experiences in a number of Arab and foreign countries, in front of the Transitional Justice Working Group during their first section of activities.
- Sunday, June 30: Constitutional expert and former Mauritanian minister of foreign affairs Mohammed Al-Hasan delivered two separate lectures to the State-Building and Southern Issue Working Groups entitled "Constitution Drafting Commission: Controls and Standards" in which he reviewed the national foundations used for forming a commission to draft the constitution of a country and the controls and standards which must be taken into consideration. French Expert Jean Marc delivered a lecture to the Southern Issue Working Group on financial decentralization, its types, authorizations, obstacles, and solutions.
- Tuesday, July 2nd: The National Reconciliation, Transitional Justice and National Issues Working Group listened to a lecture delivered by constitutional expert, former Mauritanian minister of foreign affairs Mohammed Al-Hasan.
- Wednesday, July 3: The National Issues, National Reconciliation and Transitional Justice Working Group listened to a lecture delivered by international expert, Deputy Director of the Middle East & North Africa Program in the International Center for Transitional Justice (ICTJ) Anne Maseji, and Director of the North Africa Office in the ICTJ, Mr. Mohammed Abdul-Da'im on the mechanisms and principles of transitional justice and national reconciliation and how to handle them according to the nature and special features of Yemen.

<u>Protests</u>

- Wednesday, May 8: A number of the NDC members organized a protest against the appointments at the Central Organization for Control & Audit (COCA). Moreover, a number of the Raima Province representatives at the NDC organized a protest, asking for more attention to be paid to their province, which was described as forgotten and demanded providing it with the deserved share of development projects. Tens of the NDC members protested for creating a strategy to address the qat problem.



- Saturday, May 11: A number of NDC members organized a protest against the situation of insecurity, acts of violence, and assassinations witnessed in some of the southern provinces.
- **Sunday, May 12:** A number of the NDC members organized a protest, calling for adopting an electoral system for the appointments in the academic institutions.
- **Saturday, May 18:** The NDC Presidium suspended the sessions for one day, in protest of the killing of the two young men, Aman and Al-Khateeb, and met the families of the two martyrs Khaled Al-Khateeb and Hasan Aman.
- **Sunday, May 19:** NDC members staged a protest that lasted for hours, calling for handing over the perpetrators who are convicted with the murder of the two young men Khaled Al-Khateeb and Hasan Aman.
- **Sunday, May 19:** A number of the NDC members organized a protest for the killing of Lieut. Col. Abdullah Al-Ribaki, a military officer, in Hadhramout, and asking for the arrest of the perpetrators and bringing them to justice.
- Sunday, June 2nd: A number of the NDC members staged a protest, condemning the assassinations in Hadhramout and the attack committed by soldiers against a family in Amran.
- **Monday, June 3:** A number of the NDC female members, with the participation of other male members, organized a protest, calling for a reconsideration of the female quota in the Consensus Committee.
- **Monday, June 10:** The Ansarollah Entity organized a protest against the bloody event at the gate of the National Security Apparatus.

Secretariat's Activities:

- Monday, May 20: NDC Secretary General Dr. Ahmed Awadh bin Mubarak, and First Deputy Dr. Afrah Al-Zoubah met a World Bank delegation led by Bala Krishna Minon, Senior Social Development Specialist in the Middle East and North Africa.
- Sunday, June 2nd: NDC Secretary General Dr. Ahmed Awadh bin Mubarak met UN Assistant
 Secretary General and Special Envoy to Yemen Mr. Jamal bin Omar.
- Monday, June 3: The NDC Secretary General Dr. Ahmed Awadh bin Mubarak chaired a meeting for the directors of the NDC Secretariat's departments, dedicated to the discussion of the arrangements for the Second Plenary Session which would start on June 8.



- Tuesday, June 4: The NDC non-partisan entities (youth, women, civil society organizations, and the President's List) selected their representatives to talk about the nine issues at the Second Plenary Session.
- **Saturday June 15:** The NDC Secretariat organized a gallery for photos, booklets, brochures, and publications that showcased the community participation in the NDC.
- Wednesday, June 19: An extensive meeting was held at the NDC Media Center, involving the general managers of the local radio stations nationwide, and the leaders of the NDC Secretariat.
- **Wednesday, June 5:** The Secretary General and the UNICEF Representative in Yemen discussed the conditions of children and their reflection in the NDC.
- Wednesday June 19: The NDC Deputy Secretary General Dr. Afrah Al-Zoubah launched the consultative meeting for the ambassadors of the dialogue in the provinces at the Sana'a-based Dialogue Tent.
- **Tuesday July 2nd:** The NDC Communication and Media Director Mr. Mohammed Al-Asadi presented a working paper as a contribution to the group discussions on the media and its responsibilities towards the NDC.

Secretariat's Obstacles:

- RASD Coalition was obstructed by the Secretariat as they were denied authorization to enter and oversee the closed sessions of Working Groups, under the pretext that the Working Groups refused to admit the observers. However, RASD Coalition leaders were informed by some members in private that they would welcome any observer.
- At the Second Plenary Session, only one observer was let into the sessions; the justification was that the event required only one observer and that it would suffice to just have one observer for the purpose of oversight.

Events Outside the NDC Halls:

- **Thursday May 15:** Armed groups circled the house of the NDC member Fuad Al-Himiari. The Security forces intervened later and the armed groups fled the scene.
- Sunday, May 19: There was a quarrel and exchange of insults between leader of the Southern Issue Working Group Mr. Mohammed Ali Ahmed and southern activist and member of the Army and Security Working Group Liza Al-Hasani following the latter's call on some of the Southern Issue Working Group's members to suspend the session and join



the protest against the killing of the two young men Khaled Mohammed Al-Khateeb and Hasan Ja'far Aman.

- **Monday, May 20:** The families of the two martyrs Al-Khateeb and Aman appealed to the NDC members to resume their activities and thanked them for their responsiveness.
- **Monday, May 20:** The Ministry of Education issued a general memo to its offices in the Capital City and all provinces and districts to launch a comprehensive integrated awareness campaign on the NDC.
- **Monday, May 20:** The NDC member Mohammed Salem Akkoush was kidnapped by gunmen from Al-Jaradi tribe.
- Wednesday, May 22: The NDC member Sheikh Mohammed Salem Akkoush was released. President of the Republic and the NDC Secretary General met Sheikh Akkoush separately.
- Thursday, June 20 (Morning): About 120 young males and females from all over the country participated in a voluntary initiative to draw and reiterate the dialogue motto by projecting it on the 300 meters X 40 meters slope of Attan Moutain at the heart of the Capital City of Sana'a. Their motto read as follows: Despite the strong storms, difficult mission, and high risks, the dream of new Yemen will remain as firm in our hearts as the mountain of Attan is firmly sitting at the heart of the city."
- **Saturday, July 6:** The session was adjourned by the NDC Presidium and the concluding statement was postponed until the next plenary session on the following day because the statement was not ready and included no verdicts.

Atmosphere of Closed Sessions of Working Groups

- Generally speaking, all the NDC members attend the sessions late and start the sessions later than the scheduled time by about half an hour and sometimes one whole hour so that the sessions did not start at 9:00 a.m. as scheduled. Over the period covered by the report, the sessions started half an hour late; the Working Groups and days vary.
- The sessions were always concluded not later than 1:30 p.m., and most sessions were concluded before that time. However, according to the bylaw, a session has to be concluded at 02:00 p.m.
- The daily agenda of most of the Working Groups overseen by RASD Coalition were reviewed initially at the beginning of the session. Then, the items to be discussed at the session would be selected. Nevertheless, the average percentage of the agenda items discussed in a session was up to 70% of the whole number of items. In most sessions, some items would be postponed until future sessions.



- The break time was half an hour as described in the NDC bylaw. However, most of the session breaks would last up to one hour and even one and a half hours. This is against the session timetable which assigns half an hour to the break and is against the achievements of the members, progress of the NDC and the achievement of its objectives.
- The Working Groups' members were frequently entering and exiting the sessions. Up to 73% of the total number of NDC members were doing that during the period covered by the report.
- Lack of discipline by the Working Groups' members inside the halls and at the sessions. As per the timesheets, there are many names of members while in the halls the number is less than that and even less by half. Others were hanging around outside the halls and in the hotel's lobbies.
- Sources stressed that most of the topics are agreed upon outside the halls when the entities would meet their representatives. The work was progressing outside the halls, in the lobbies among the entities.
- Some were not giving due attention to the dialogue. They were found engaging in insignificant issues. The hall was one world and they were in another, engrossed in side talk, browsing newspapers, etc.
- It was perceived that there was some sort of calmness and self-restraint among the members of each single Working Group. There were no incidents of verbal quarrels except in a very few cases. In certain cases, a sense of harmless humor would appear.
- A nice air of communication was there between the Presidium members and other members.
- It was noted that the President's List members were the frequently absent and Al-Rashad representatives were absent the least. Most latecomers were women.
- There was much disturbing activity inside the hall and the members did not sit in their designated seats. Moreover, they were talking while the Presidium was talking. There was the feeling that the session lacked discipline.
- Some members of the Working Groups were outside the hall during the functions of the session.
- There was miscommunication between the members and the Presidium due to noise and side talk in the hall during the Second Plenary Session.
- Interruptions by some members, and distraction of discussion.
- Not giving sufficient attention by some members to the ongoing discussion as they were, for example, engrossed in newspaper browsing, side talk, etc.



- Lack of punctuality and discipline, and frequent entries and exits during the discussion.
- Absence of the Working Group members from the hall for a long period without the permission of the session chairman. Much time was wasted.
- In general, there was some condescending language—the language of dominance over the events of the NDC.

Media Communication

- The closed sessions are naturally indirect, according to the statement of the Secretariat: The Working Group members can express their opinions smoothly, away from the cameras which restrict freedom, simplicity and clarity.
- It was noted that the media coverage was not as it was in the past. The media outlets that were present at the kickoff of the NDC diminished in number.
- The NDC Secretariat's website focuses on secondary matters and not on the essential issues that can benefit the citizen or the observer. The website lacks key information.
- The activities and media resources of the Secretariat lack community participation and the contribution of citizens. This shows that there is a gap between the Secretariat and the media and communication resources. Some NDC member personalities appeared in some media outlets while the citizen-centered community participation is lacking.
- The official media's live broadcasting of the events of the Second Plenary Session was remarkable.

NDC Presidium

- Tuesday May 7: President of the Republic's Resolution No. (29) for the year 2013 was issued with the appointment of Mr. Yaseen Omar Ahmed Makkawi Deputy Chairman of the NDC instead of Mr. Ahmed bin Fareed Al-Suraimah. According the NDC Media Center, President Hadi's Resolution comes after the President recommended him and the People of the South Conference elected him Deputy Chairman for the NDC.
- **Sunday, May 19:** There was a joint meeting among the NDC Presidium, Secretariat and the Working Groups' leaders which approved that protest stands may be done after 1:00 p.m. of each working day.
- Sunday, June 2nd: The NDC Presidium denounced the delay of releasing the Nonviolent Youth Revolution detainees.



- Sunday, June 2nd: The NDC Presidium and the families of the two martyrs Khaled Al-Khateeb and Hasan Aman listened to the developments of the case from Minister of Interior Dr. Abdul-Qadir Qahtan.
- **Tuesday, June 11:** The NDC Presidium decided to prevent any acts of protest as well as any statement readings or stands inside the NDC hall.
- **Sunday, July 7:** President of the Republic, Chairman of the NDC headed a meeting for the NDC Presidium.

Second Plenary Session

- Saturday June 8: The Second Plenary Session was opened at the President's house. The session saw speeches by the President of the Republic, the UN Secretary General Envoy, the GCC Secretary General and the NDC Secretary General. A documentary movie was displayed, showcasing 80 days of dialogue, explaining the events of the dialogue conducted by the Working Groups. During the Second Plenary Session, the NDC members would review the reports of the nine Working Groups that would include the outcomes, draft decisions and recommendations reached by the Working Groups.
- **Sunday, June 9:** The first working session of the NDC Second Plenary Session was held. It was presided by the NDC Chairmen Deputies Dr. Abdul-Karim Al-Eryani and Dr. Yasin Sa'eed No'man.
- **Monday, June 10:** The activities of the NDC Second Plenary Session continued, chaired by Mr. Mohamed Qahtan deputizing the NDC Deputy Chairman Abdul-Wahab Al-Anisi.

The session started with a discussion and approval of the session agenda. Presidium Rapporteur Dr. Abdullah Lamlas reviewed a report of the absence and attendance in the previous session.

A number of members forwarded their remarks on the voting mechanism for the draft decisions included in the Working Groups' reports. They emphasized that the submitted remarks had to be taken into consideration before the voting.

Then the NDC Presidium discussed the member-submitted suggestions. Later, the Chairman of the session announced the postponement of voting on the decisions and reports, the reference of the remarks to the Working Groups for inclusion, and resubmission of the decisions for voting.

 Monday, June 10: The Good Governance Working Group reviewed their report for the activities during the first session at the third working session of the NDC Second Plenary Session. It was presented by Judge Afrah Badwailan, leader of the Working Group.



- The Working Group consensually agreed on the following decisions, taking into consideration the outcomes of the State-Building and Southern-Issue Working Groups. They agreed to submit the decisions to the Second Plenary Session for approval and adoption by the NDC:
 - 1. The Constitution shall provide for no immunity at all for corruption crimes.
 - 2. The Constitution shall provide for the autonomy and transparency of the oversight authorities and their commitment to disseminating their reports.
 - 3. The Constitution shall provide for the incrimination of the violations in the governmental tenders, bids and purchases, and shall provide for the regulations and deterring penalties.
 - 4. The Constitution shall provide for the incrimination of smuggling in all its forms.
 - 5. The Constitution shall provide for no immunity for the high positions officials, and all shall be subject to liability and accountability.
 - 6. The Constitution shall provide for the adoption of the good governance principles by all governmental bodies and civil society organizations.
 - 7. The Constitution shall provide that no taxes, no customs, no fees and no levies shall be collected except under the law.
 - 8. The Constitution shall provide that the oil and gas companies and all investment companies are obligated to treat all the effects on the environment and human beings done by such companies and shall provide for the incrimination of such violations.
 - 9. The Constitution shall provide that it is mandatory to apply the principle of international transparency in the field of extractive industry
 - 10. The Constitution shall provide for the prohibition of burying any radioactive, chemical or nuclear waste inside the country.
 - 11. The Constitution shall provide for equal opportunities and distributing the high level positions in the government between the northern and southern parts in halves, in case Yemen remains as one-state.
 - 12. The political parties and organizations and the civil society organizations shall be committed to the internal democratic rules and the application of the good governance principles inside and outside the political party or organization.
 - 13. The political parties shall have an independent board, whose members shall be elected from honest non-partisan personalities. Such a board shall register the parties and evaluate their performance.

- 14. The civil society organizations shall have an independent board, whose members shall be elected from honest non-partisan personalities. Such a board shall register the parties and evaluate their performance.
- 15. The government shall support the political parties and organizations and the civil society organizations financially, from the public budget. The political parties and organizations shall be prohibited from receiving any foreign funds. The civil society organizations shall be prohibited from receiving any foreign funds except for developmental purposes.
- 16. The incrimination of the exploitation of the public money, public media, and the civil and military apparatuses of the government to serve a specific party or group. The ruling party or coalition shall be prohibited from monopolizing the public posts except for the high level political positions.
- 17. The Constitution shall provide for the right of citizens to organize themselves into political parties and civil society organizations in order to enhance the public will.
- 18. The Constitution shall provide that the citizens have the right to access information in an absolutely transparent way.
- 19. The law shall provide for the cultural and educational perspectives of the good governance principles.
- 20. The Terms and Definitions section shall define the word "citizen" as any Yemeni citizen (male or female).
- 21. Women shall be represented in the three authorities of the state with a quota no less than 30%, and the youth with a quota no less than 20%.
- 22. In addition to the constitutional proviews, there must be a national policy that reflects positively the roles of women and youth which contributes to the promotion free from discrimination against them.
- 23. The State shall ensure compulsory and free-of-charge primary education. It shall also ensure that the secondary, university and technical-vocational education is free of charge. It shall take the necessary measures for that purpose.
- 24. The State shall provide free-of-charge health services. It shall enhance and activate the legislative and executive frames for basic healthcare and reproductive health services.
- 25. The Constitution shall provide for the incrimination of any authority that circumvents the Constitution and laws or does not enforce the proviews thereof.



- 26. The Constitution shall provide for the separation among the three authorities and the prevention of one authority overpowering another.
- 27. The Constitution shall provide for the prohibition and incrimination of the combination of both authority and commerce.
- 28. The Constitution shall provide for the separation of political activity from the civil activity and non-alignment of the public post, incrimination of its monopoly or its exploitation.
- 29. The Constitution shall provide for the autonomy and unity of the judiciary, so that the judiciary becomes the only entity with jurisdiction over the settlement of any disputes whatsoever.
- 30. The Constitution shall provide that the positions in the Supreme Court and the Judicial Council shall be held by judges elected by the General Assembly, which comprises all judges with their different degrees, in accordance with a special electoral system.
- **Tuesday, June 11:** The NDC held its fourth working session under the Second Plenary Session, chaired by Mr. Sultan Al-Atwani, NDC Deputy Chairman.

The NDC members listened to the remarks of the political entities on the Good Governance Report which were reviewed in front of the Working Group. The participants submitted a number of remarks, views and ideas which they thought were necessary to be included in the Report and outcomes of the Good Governance Working Group. The above remarks and suggestions would be included in the Report. The Leader of the Good Governance Working Group responded to the remarks that had been presented by the NDC members. She said that the Report included outlines, views and ideas, adding that drafting the clauses is the task of the Constitution Drafting Committee which would be formed after the conclusion of the NDC activities. She noted further that the Report was consensually agreed upon by all entities.

- Wednesday, June 12: The Leader of Sa'ada Issue Working Group Mrs. Nabeela Al-Zubair reviewed the final report for the previous period in front of the NDC Second Plenary Session. The Working Group reviewed the activities they had undertaken over the previous period.

The highlighted activities included the formation of a select committee comprising representatives of all entities in order to formulate the detailed plan which had been prepared and approved last April.



- **Tuesday, June 18:** The final report of National Issues, National Reconciliation and Transitional Justice Working Group was reviewed by its leader Dr. Abdul-Bari Dughaish. The Report included a number of consensually agreed decisions, which were submitted to the Plenary Session for approval. Some of the Working Group's members objected, saying that the circulated report is not the agreed upon report. Therefore, it was noted that there was no consensus among the members of the concerned Working Group.
- Wednesday, June 19: Completion of the hearing of the remarks and suggestions concerning the Report of the National Issues, National Reconciliation, and Transitional Justice Working Group. The State-Building Working Group's Report was reviewed by the leader of the Working Group Dr. Mohammed Marem. The relevant remarks and suggestions were heard from the members.
- **Sunday, June 23:** The Second Plenary Session was still in progress. The Southern Issue Working Group's Final Report was reviewed by the Working Group's Rapporteur Mr. Shafee' Al-Abd.
- **Monday, June 24:** The NDC carried on with its activities, hearing the suggestions and opinions of the members concerning the Southern Issue Report presented to the Second Plenary Session the previous day.
- Wednesday, June 26: The nine Working Groups held a joint meeting to include the remarks presented by the NDC members on the First Session's reports. The Working Group's members discussed the amendments and suggestions submitted by the NDC members in the Second Plenary Session.
- Monday, July 1st: The NDC Working Groups finished the task of including the remarks that had been suggested in the Second Plenary Session on the Working Groups' reports. The Good Governance Working Group finished the amendment of 16 articles in the Report and kept 11 articles unchanged. The total number of the National Issues, National Reconciliation and Transitional Justice Working Group's decisions, as per the voting of members, was 39—12 of which received remarks in the Plenary Session and were discussed by the select committee; the number of decisions that had been amended and voted in the hall was four, and one new decision was added.

However, the reports of the State-Building, Sa'ada Issue and Southern Issue were not amended because they did not contain decisions. Their decisions are to be issued by the end of the NDC.

- **Tuesday, July 2nd:** The Working Groups started approving their plans for the next period and submitting them to the Consensus Committee.



- For the Period of May 7 -July 8, 2013
- Monday, July 8: The concluding working session of the NDC Second Plenary Session was convened. The Final Report of the First Session was read aloud, which included the decisions reached by the Working Groups during the previous period of the NDC activities, except the Southern Issue, Sa'ada Issue and State-Building Working Groups.

Atmosphere of the Second Plenary Session

- The Second Plenary Session is a series of review sessions to explain the remarks and submit opinions regarding the topics of the reports. There were no decisions or discussions. It was in the form of hearing. Therefore, the sessions can be called hearings.
- Facilitators and administrators were brought to do their routine work of assisting the Presidium and the members in running the session.
- International observers were there. Their role was simply observation.
- Some people were distributing publications in the hall that incite hatred against some NDC entities and members.
- There were many timeouts during the talk of some members. They were unnecessary. Just for interruption.
- Some speakers' language displayed a bombastic tone that did not support the session.
- Disturbance in the hall: In one session, a large number of participants came over to the front area at the podium and to the speaker pulpit, raising their voices, without respect for the Presidium which caused the temporary suspension of the session at 10:42 a.m.
- Sunday, June 9: The Ansarollah Entity (The Houthis) representatives and the People's General Congress representatives withdrew from the Plenary Session. One member of Ansarollah verbally attacked Dr. Yasin Sa'eed No'man.
- A number of the Presidium members were absent. Sometimes, a session would be managed by just two members in the second period, after the session.
- The hall was for groups having side talks.
- There was no real interaction with the talk of the speakers such as the remarks or corrections for the reports.
- The Working Groups did not stick to their squares inside the hall. You would find them overlapping each other or gathering as entity blocs which led to noise because of side talks.
- The Presidium did not remain in the podium during the activities of the session.
- Speakers did not consider time, and members returned late after the break. In some sessions, the attendance was remarkably low after the break.



- There was constant noise and activity (entries, exits and groups talking in the corners of the hall, detached from the activities of the session).
- In some sessions, some people chanted mottos that would provoke the participants.
- There were facilitators under the Working Groups cooperating with the Working Groups' members in the communication with the Presidium and the provision with the literatures and reports. There were international observers with their role limited to hearing only.

Standards & Discipline Committee

- Wednesday, May 29: Mrs. Najeeba Mutahar, member of the National Issues and Transitional Justice Working Group, was referred due to her verbal attack on the Square youths, after the screening of a documentary on the fire at the Freedom Square in Taiz.

Consensus Committee

Sunday, June 2nd: President of the Republic issued Resolution No. (41) for the year 2013 promulgating the formation of the NDC Consensus Committee including the following:

- Structure of the NDC Opinion Consensus Committee as follows:
 - NDC Presidium.
 - NDC Working Groups' leaders.
 - The following men and women:
 - 1- Tawakul Abdussalam Khaled Karman
 - 2- Husam Al-Sharjabi
 - 3- Hussein Mohamed Arab
 - 4- Raqiah Abdul-Qadir Humaidan
 - 5- Dr. Saleh Ali Basurah
 - 6- Dr. Mohamed Mosa Al-Ameri
- Article (2) Responsibilities of the Consensus Committee:
 - The NDC Consensus Committee shall have the following responsibilities:
 - 1- Reconciling the members of a Working Group in connection with the disputed issues and providing suggestions to settle the disagreements.
 - 2- Consulting the members and entities regarding the disputed issues in order to come out with a reconciliatory opinion.
 - 3- Coordinating the outcomes of the different Working Groups.
 - 4- Following up the implementation of the NDC decisions and making sure that they are implemented after the NDC activities are finished.

37



Article (3) Consensus Committee Mechanism

- a- For the purpose of implementing the responsibilities of the Consensus Committee designated in Article (2) hereof, the Consensus Committee shall, during the sessions of the Working Groups, do the following:
 - 1- Meet on a weekly basis to follow up on the progress of the different Working Groups, as required by the developments.
 - 2- Continued follow-up of the deliberations inside the Working Groups in order to identify the common visions and the disputed topics from the perspective of reconciling the different viewpoints.
 - 3- Do its best to enhance the coordination among the Working Groups from the perspective of consensus.
 - 4- Follow up the implementation of the action plans prepared by the Working Groups in order to ensure the achievement of the desirable progress.
 - 5- Work closely with all Working Groups in order to achieve the desirable progress, and build harmony by giving verbal, and if necessary, written instructions.
 - 6- Provide consultations for the Working Groups in the preparation for the plenary sessions by guiding them on how to prepare the required reports and submitting them to the plenary sessions in cooperation with the Secretariat.
 - 7- Coordinate with the Secretariat on the implementation of the above activities. For that purpose, the Secretary General or, if absent, either of his Deputies shall be present at the Consensus Committee meetings, without having the right to vote.
 - 8- Help the Working Groups build consensus and come out with decisions in accordance with Article (41) of the NDC bylaw.
- Monday, June 3: President of the Republic, Chairman of the NDC, chaired a meeting for the NDC Consensus Committee at the President's house in the presence of UN Secretary General Advisor and Envoy Jamal bin Omar.
- Wednesday, June 5: The Consensus Committee, chaired by NDC Deputy Chairman Dr. Abdul-Karim Al-Eryani, held a meeting dedicated to the assignment of the Consensus Committee's tasks and the preparation for the Second Plenary Session. At the meeting, it was agreed that the Consensus Committee would count the overlapping or disputed topics, then analyze and study them, and separate the constitutional decisions from the laws, procedures and policies. The program of the Second Plenary Session was approved, which defined the mechanism followed for running the session, the method of voting, the



reading, order and discussion of the nine Working Group's reports submitted to the NDC Presidium.

- Monday, June 17: The NDC Consensus Committee held a session chaired by Dr. Abdul-Karim Al-Eryani. The session was dedicated to the discussion of a number of the agenda items. The Consensus Committee unanimously agreed to appoint Mr. Husam Al-Sharjabi rapporteur of the Consensus Committee. The Transitional Justice Working Group's Report was also reviewed and relevant remarks were submitted.
- Tuesday, June 18: The NDC Consensus Committee held a meeting chaired by Dr. Yehya Al-Shaeebi. At the meeting, Consensus Committee member Mrs. Nadia Al-Saqqaf presented a summary of the previous meeting's minutes. Then, it was discussed and approved. The meeting also discussed a suggestion regarding a rotational presidium of the Consensus Committee as well as its action plan. Remarks were submitted by the members and it was agreed to define an urgent meeting with the leaders of the entities represented in the NDC to discuss the consensus mechanism in the Second Plenary Session.
- **Sunday, June 23:** In a meeting chaired by Mr. Abu Bakr Batheeb instead of Dr. Yasin Sa'eed No'man, the NDC Consensus Committee approved its action plan for the coming period.
- Wednesday, June 26: In a meeting chaired by Abu Bakr Batheeb instead of Dr. Yasin Sa'eed No'man, the Consensus Committee agreed to assign the NDC Secretariat to set up a mechanism for following up the NDC decisions and a consensus mechanism for the final plenary session and the final reports of the Working Groups. The Committee agreed to refer the disputed points in the Transitional Justice Working Group's Report to the Working Group itself for agreement and, thereby, approval. If agreement was not to be reached, the above points would be referred to the Consensus Committee.
- Sunday, June 30: Chaired by Mr. Mahmoud Al-Junaid instead of Saleh Habrah, the Consensus Committee discussed at its meeting the overlap and clash between the decisions that require voting. The meeting discussed also the progress of the implementation timetable of the the consensus process as stated in the Mechanism for Reviewing the Reports of the Working Groups, their Consensus and the Follow-up of the Progress in the Working Group's Plans.
- Monday, July 1st: President Abdu Rabbou Mansour Hadi held a meeting in the morning at the President's house attended by the NDC Consensus Committee members and the UN Envoy Jamal bin Omar to see the extent of progress made by the different committees and Working Groups within the NDC framework.



_

For the Period of May 7 -July 8, 2013

Wednesday, July 3: The Consensus Committee held a meeting to discuss the timetable for the remaining activities of the NDC. The Committee agreed to hold a weekly meeting for the Working Group leaders to coordinate the functions of the Working Groups and eliminate the overlap or clash among their activities before the topics could be referred to the Consensus Committee. The Committee agreed to proactively follow up the activities of the Working Groups, before the problems could be referred to the Consensus Committee.

Participation Report

Attendance and Absence of All Entities During the Period Covered by this Report (41 Sessions)

Entity	Morning Signature		Leave Signature	
	Attendance %	Absence %	Attendance %	Absence %
GPC & Allies	88%	12%	85%	15%
Nonviolent Southern Movement	83%	17%	88%	12%
wovement				
President's List	75%	25%	67%	33%
Islah Party	92%	8%	93%	7%
NGOs	96%	4%	96%	4%
Youth List	95%	5%	95%	5%
Woman List	95%	5%	95%	5%
Socialist Party	98%	2%	98%	2%
Ansarollah	93%	7%	92%	8%
People's Unionist Nasserite	97%	3%	96%	4%
Organization				
Al-Rashad Party	97%	3%	92%	8%
Justice & Construction Party	93%	7%	89%	11%



Yemeni Unionist Congregation	99%	1%	100%	0%
National Council of Revolution	95%	5%	96%	4%
Forces				
Union of Public Forces	91%	9%	90%	10%
Al-Haq Party	96%	4%	95%	5%
Total	93%	7%	92%	8%

The above table shows the percentages of attendance and absence for the morning session for all participating entities as reported by the NDC website. It is clear that the entity with the highest percentage of absence is the President's List in all Working Groups. Yet, we have not seen any action on the part of the Standards & Discipline Committee in this regard.

Moreover, the attendance tables posted on the NDC website include some misinformation such as the number of entities' members. The number of some entities' members, for example the Union of Public Forces was shown to be five on one day while the number was actually four only. This is wrong information. We discussed this in our previous report but in vain. The data is still inconsistent, based on misinformation.